



A • M • E • R • I • C • A • N
A N T H R O P O L O G I C A L
A S S O C I A T I O N

Democracy and Ethnography: Constructing Identities in Multicultural Liberal States by Carol Greenhouse

Review by: Rosemary J. Coombe

American Ethnologist, Vol. 30, No. 4 (Nov., 2003), pp. 627-628

Published by: [Blackwell Publishing](#) on behalf of the [American Anthropological Association](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3805259>

Accessed: 05/11/2011 15:48

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Blackwell Publishing and *American Anthropological Association* are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *American Ethnologist*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Much was lost, but what remains is now in the Australian Museum in Sydney. Todd himself eventually left anthropology, having published five articles on New Britain and a small catalogue of the original collection.

Beatrice Blackwood was deeply interested in material culture and left a rich body of documentation along with her collection. In 1936, the Pitt Rivers Museum sponsored her research on the production and use of stone tools in New Guinea, after which she traveled to the southwest coast of New Britain to study head deformation. By the time Blackwood did her fieldwork there were many whites living in the area. She did her best to avoid them and spent about four months doing fieldwork in remote villages. She was interested in process and, like the other collectors featured in the volume, acquired tools, raw materials, and partially completed objects. She was particularly interested in the designs of canoe paddles and in the process of making bark cloth used for head binding.

Gosden and Knowles's book includes a quantitative comparison of the 901 extant objects from the four collections. Although these collections cannot be assumed to exhaustively represent the material culture of the area at any particular time, they suggest to the authors that over the three decades of collecting there was a decline in the number of objects collected relating to male-centered rituals, a decline in the number of stone axes, and a shift from the use of shields as objects of warfare to their use as decorative commodities. The authors suggest that an increased demand by tourists and others for things like decorated shields led to changes in designs.

The authors note that from the earliest ethnographies of the Pacific until the present there has been an intense anthropological interest in objects and exchange systems in New Guinea. This has resulted over the years in a rich body of work in economic anthropology, by researchers from Bronislaw Malinowski to Nicholas Thomas. Gosden and Knowles suggest that this interest is itself a product of colonialism in that it reflects the way in which objects were used by both New Britains

and foreigners to construct their relationships. The authors take issue with some scholars who have posited Western culture and indigenous New Britain culture as two separate, intersecting domains. They contend that the exchange of objects between New Britains and other Pacific Islanders and between New Britains and Westerners created colonial society. Whether this is a significant difference in approach, or whether it takes sufficient account of the institutional, economic, and political contexts underpinning colonialism, is a valid question, but in any case the argument gets overtaken by the many subthemes that are developed in the book. These include not only the four collection histories and descriptions of the collections but also the histories of the museums and institutions that sponsored the collecting, the history of material culture studies in anthropology as a whole, and the material culture of New Britain itself. Despite its shifting focus, the book will be of interest to area specialists and to people interested in thinking about scholarship using museum collections. Although the collections cannot tell the whole story of colonialism, they certainly should be reinserted into it.

Democracy and Ethnography: Constructing Identities in Multicultural Liberal States. Carol Greenhouse, ed., with *Roshanak Kheshti*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1998. x + 205 pp.

ROSEMARY J. COOMBE

York University

The contributors to this volume bring anthropological insight to bear on the issue of social difference in two democratic societies that "acknowledge and accommodate cultural diversity as a dimension of citizenship" (p. 1). The authors of these 12 chapters focus on state practices and examine official constructions of identity and difference in the United States and Spain. Contributors who consider the United States address tensions between race, class, and culture and the cultural means through which inequalities are produced, repressed, and denied. All of the contributors are critical of the rei-

fied differences propounded by the official discourses they explore and emphasize that categories of difference emerge and assume significance through specific institutional rhetorical practices.

These chapters were first presented at a 1993 conference. This is not at all evident in the introductory theoretical synthesis by Carol Greenhouse and Davydd Greenwood, which is lively, informative, and contemporary. Many of the individual contributions, however, do not appear to have been sufficiently updated in the five years between the conference and the publication of the volume. This is less significant in the essays about Spain, which tend to focus on language, nationality, territory, and the specific emergence of group rights and which are more clearly based on ethnographic and historical research. The contributors who address practices in the United States, however, have chosen to orient their essays theoretically so as to advance understandings of individualism, ethnicity, race, and citizenship. These topics have been the subjects of an intense proliferation of interdisciplinary scholarship in recent years. As Greenhouse and Greenwood acknowledge, a burgeoning literature in cultural studies, influenced by postcolonial theory, has subjected the concepts of nation, the state, and even society itself to critical cultural scrutiny. The same is true of concepts of race, citizenship, the public, civil society, and individuality. Through this recent literature scholars have developed a new theoretical arsenal enriched with deconstructionist and psychoanalytic insights. The essays included in this volume do not adequately engage with this literature, but they supplement it with close studies of the legal and political discourses through which cultural difference is institutionally constructed, recognized, and managed in communal terms.

The essays on the United States examine a range of issues: practices in which class, race, and gender are elided or domesticated and ethnicity naturalized through ideologies of the "melting pot" in everyday life (Herve Varenne); the emphasis on blood as an indicator of race in state statistical

practice (Daniel Segal); naturalization requirements and ethnic media and the rhetorics of model citizenship reflected, reinforced, and incited by each (Bonnie Urcioli); the unmarked point of omniscience from which census categories emerge (Dvora Yanow); pedagogical techniques in legal education (Beth Mertz); the idealization of population in congressional immigration hearings (Phyllis Pease Chock); and the subtle ways in which images of order and disorder are used to manage cultural difference in constitutional law and political theory (Austin Sarat and Roger Berkowitz). With the exception of Mertz's contribution, which includes transcriptions of law school classroom dialogues, the essays on the United States are not based on ethnographic fieldwork; most engage in the interpretation of readily available texts (appellate case law, records of congressional hearings and legislative history, census questions, and state forms). They are critical analyses of dominant discourses and rhetorical practices that might be taken as characteristic of such discourses. Very likely, the practices examined by these authors are representative, but more explicit explanation of the methodology used and the range of texts considered would have been welcome in all of these essays, as would some consideration of how discourse analysis in democratic societies expands our understandings of what constitutes the very practice of ethnography and its purposes.

All of the essays considering Spanish state discourses and practices squarely address the issue of anthropology's role in creating and contributing to the recognition of cultural difference and the political contributions of ethnography in pluralist societies. The volume would cohere and carry more force if the U.S. contributors had assumed the responsibility of addressing these concerns.

Jesus Prieto de Pedro contributes a useful and accessible historical introduction to the place of culture within the Spanish constitutional framework. He provides a helpful perspective from which to contrast the U.S. analyses (which would have benefited from a similar essay providing the reader with

a juridical framework in which to situate the diverse discourses and practices explored by the authors). The Spanish Constitution of 1978 extends rights of cultural autonomy to territorial communities recognized to represent the "peoples of Spain" (p. 69) and their distinctive cultures while integrating them into the "common culture" of the Spanish nation, for which the state serves as guardian. In Jose A. Fernandez de Rota Monter's ethnographically rich essay on the history and discourse of Galician political movements and the rhetorical forms used to express and to assert Galician identity, one sees how a strong sense of regional ethnocultural distinction and linguistic identity may harmoniously coexist with a felt sense of belonging to the Spanish nation. Another of Spain's "historical nationalities," that tied to the "Basque Country," is addressed by Jesus Azcona, who explores the historical contexts in which Basque culture and tradition were invented and uses survey data to assess transformations in the meanings of Basque identity, suggesting that peoples in the autonomous region have rejected the naturalized and racialized concept of culture (the product of a long tradition of anthropological research) that was used by activists to legitimate Basque political autonomy. The last two Spanish essays consider genres of anthropological research in the construction of official understandings of cultural difference. Honorio M. Velasco considers the evolution of folklore studies as a form of popular political work in modern nation-building. Josep M. Comelles shows how the declining role of ethnography in professional medicine and its relegation to anthropology had the effect of naturalizing social inequalities, depoliticizing cultural difference, and domesticating ethnography's potential as a revolutionary force for social change. His observations on the differences in anthropological self-understanding in the Spanish and U.S. contexts are enlightening. More expressly comparative inquiry of this kind would have ensured that the rich material and analysis brought by the various authors to the volume served to realize the potential insights of cross-cultural political inquiry. Read-

ers will appreciate the mapping of this intellectual terrain for further anthropological endeavor.

Divine Utterances: The Performance of Afro-Cuban Santería. *Katherine Hagedorn.* Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 2001. viii + 296 pp., figures, CD, glossary, discography, filmography, references, index.

KENNETH BILBY

Smithsonian Institution

In this recent addition to the growing literature on the Cuban religion known as Santería, Katherine Hagedorn deftly combines autobiography, ethnography, history, and cultural criticism, stretching the boundaries of ethnomusicological inquiry.

Like many ethnomusicologists, Hagedorn came to the field through an interest in becoming a competent performer in a musical tradition that was foreign to her. Intrigued and moved by the power of sacred *batá* drumming, she gradually became apprenticed to an eminent master drummer in Havana. Entering what had traditionally been an exclusively male domain, she immediately confronted performative restrictions that raised complex questions of musical meaning and authenticity. Although her teachers and fellow drummers admitted that a woman might eventually learn to reproduce the *batá* rhythms accurately, they were unwilling to teach her unless she agreed to refrain from drumming in religious contexts and promised never to play consecrated instruments. If her performance of these rhythms became acceptable only when stripped of religious meaning, then what was she doing playing them? Further complicating things, even as she kept her end of the bargain, her Cuban friends began to expect from her an increased commitment to the spiritual world of Santería, leading eventually to her initiation into the religion (which did nothing to alter the fact that, as a woman, she was barred from drumming in ceremonial contexts).

It is easy to see how this personally experienced contradiction might lead to the larger questions about authenticity and meaning that are at the heart